

CITE Student Learning Outcome Rubrics

A Guide to Constructing CITE Rubrics

This document provides the rubric template and the subcomponents of each learning outcome. It includes the following components:

- The major components of the CITE Student Learning Outcome rubric templates
- A sample rubric
- Questions to Guide your Rubric Development Process
 - Selecting your developmental level
 - Defining your performance level
- Rubric Templates for
 - Teamwork
 - Effective Communication
 - Problem Solving
 - Cultural Competency
 - Social Responsibility
 - Ethical Decision Making

The rubrics in this document were created using the *Association of American Colleges and Universities (AAC&U) Critical Thinking VALUE Rubric*. Retrieved from <https://www.aacu.org/value-rubrics>.

The Major Components of the CITE Student Learning Outcome Rubric Templates

To complete your rubrics, you'll need to make choices about the assignment you'll be assessing, the developmental level of your student participants, how you will define each performance level, and the appropriate subcomponents of your learning outcome.

The CITE Student Outcome Rubrics have 5 major components:

1. Learning Outcome
2. Assignment
3. Developmental level: Introduction, Reinforcement, and Mastery
4. Learning outcome subcomponents
5. Performance Level: Exemplary, Proficient, Competent, Needs Improvement, and Inadequate

1. There are six CITE student learning outcomes: problem solving, effective communication, teamwork, cultural competency, social responsibility, and ethical decision making. You'll need to select the two that are most appropriate for your CITE proposal. Definitions for each learning outcome are available on the CITE website at <http://www.uh.edu/provost/university/qep/outcomes/>

3. See "Selecting your developmental level" (p. 4) to determine which level is best for your project.

5. Once you have selected your subcomponents, "Defining your performance level" (p. 4) will help you write descriptions for each level.

Learning Outcome 1:	
Assignment:	2. In one sentence, describe the assignment that you will be assessing.
Developmental Level: <input type="checkbox"/> Introduction <input type="checkbox"/> Reinforcement <input type="checkbox"/> Mastery	
Performance Level	Description
Exemplary	4. The rubric template provides subcomponents for each learning outcome. Select the components that best fit your project.
Proficient	
Competent	
Needs Improvement	
Inadequate	

Sample Rubric

Learning Outcome 1: Problem Solving

Assignment: A work product as assigned by the student's supervisor

Developmental Level: Introduction Reinforcement Mastery

Performance Level	Description			
	Demonstrates understanding of the nature and context question to be answered or goal to be achieved	Designs a strategy or strategies for the problem	Evaluates strategies for solving the problem	Implements a strategy or strategies for solving the problem
Exemplary	The student can define the problem and the complex context that surrounds it.	They can identify more than one solution, and can discuss in some detail the pros and cons of each and make solid recommendations for next steps in moving towards long term solutions.		
Proficient	Students can define the problem and some of the key factors that contribute to a real-world social or economic issue.	While they can identify multiple solutions and some of the pros and cons of each, they may not have mastered some of the nuances that would represent an "exemplary" performance level.		
Competent	The student has a basic grasp of the real-world social or economic issue.	While there is some detail and supporting information, suggested solutions may not be fully formed.	While there is some detail and supporting information, they might have difficulties explaining why one solution is better than another.	
Needs Improvement	Student may have a simplistic view of a real world social or economic issue or they may lack confidence in their understanding.	While they can identify some of the issues at hand, their limited understanding makes any solution they may develop somewhat flawed.		
Inadequate	Student is not able to problem solve or recognize the complexity of real-world social or economic issues.	They are not able to suggest viable solutions.	They cannot adequately explain key factors that need addressing to find a solution.	

Because this subcomponent does not apply to the project, it is not included in final project rubric

Questions to Guide your Rubric Development Process

- 1) Selecting your developmental level: Introduction, Reinforcement, Mastery
 - Is this project the first time that the student has been introduced to the learning outcome in your particular context?
 - If you plan to select developmental level “reinforcement” or “mastery,” can you identify courses or experiences in which the participants would have engaged that would have provided them with a strong foundation of understanding and practice in the learning outcome?
 - Does the project come at the beginning, middle or end of a student’s undergraduate career?
 - As a result of this CITE co-curricular academic experience, do you expect the students to be able to
 - a. Define and explain ideas and concepts (introduction),
 - b. Use the information that they are learning in situations that are new and make connections across settings and disciplines (reinforcement), *or*
 - c. Defend a position and produce something original (mastery)?
- 2) Defining your performance levels:
 - What would a student performance be lacking if it rated “inadequate,” “needs improvement,” or “competent”?
 - What sets a student performance rated “exemplary” above one rated “proficient”?

Teamwork

Learning Outcome: Teamwork

Assignment:

Developmental Level: [] Introduction [] Reinforcement [] Mastery

Performance Level	Description - Teamwork Subcomponents				
	Considers different points of view in meetings	Works effectively with team members by meeting deadlines	Works effectively by submitting quality work	Supports a shared purpose and/or goals through contributions of work and of ideas to the team	Supports a shared purpose and/or goals by contributing to the team culture
Exemplary					
Proficient					
Competent					
Needs Improvement					
Inadequate					

- Brainstorm the ideal teamwork experience for this project, considering how the team would
 - Consider different viewpoints of team members in meetings and other interactions,
 - Work effectively by setting and meeting deadlines and by producing quality work, and
 - Support the common goal of the team by doing their share of the workload and contributing valuable ideas and through positive contributions to the team culture.

What aspects of these interactions form a basic foundation to future teamwork, what aspects would you expect to build on that foundation, and what aspects would you expect from team members who were able to create their own team guidelines?

- As a result of participating in this experience, what would you like to observe in your students' development of teamwork?

Effective Communication

Learning Outcome: Effective Communication					
Assignment:					
Developmental Level: [] Introduction [] Reinforcement [] Mastery					
Performance Level	Description – Effective Communication Subcomponents				
	Effectively develops and organizes ideas as demonstrated through message content, organization, and use of authoritative evidence	Effectively expresses ideas in a way that is appropriate for the context and purpose	Effectively expresses ideas in writing through use of language and mechanics	Effectively expresses ideas orally through delivery techniques and use of language	Effectively expresses ideas visually through materials that support and enhance the topic and are credible
Exemplary					
Proficient					
Competent					
Needs Improvement					
Inadequate					

1. Brainstorm the ideal demonstration of effective communication for this project, considering how students would
 - Demonstrate their ability to develop and organize ideas through message content, organization, and use of authoritative evidence;
 - Effectively express their ideas in a way that is appropriate for your project’s purpose and context;
 - Through proper use of language and mechanics, effectively express ideas in writing;
 - Effectively express their ideas orally through command of language and appropriate delivery; and
 - Express ideas visually through the use of materials that support and enhance the topic and that are credible and relevant.

Effective Communication (continued)

What aspects of this learning outcome form a simple foundation for effective communication, what aspects would you expect to build on that foundation, and what aspects would you expect from students who are able to create their own appropriate guidelines for effective communication?

2. As a result of participating in this experience, what would you like to observe in your students' development of effective communication skills?

Problem Solving

Learning Outcome: Problem Solving				
Assignment:				
Developmental Level: [] Introduction [] Reinforcement [] Mastery				
Performance Level	Description – Problem Solving Subcomponents			
	Demonstrates understanding of the nature and context of the question to be answered or goal to be achieved	Designs a strategy or strategies for the problem	Evaluates strategies for solving the problem	Implements a strategy or strategies for solving the problem
Exemplary				
Proficient				
Competent				
Needs Improvement				
Inadequate				

1. Brainstorm the ideal demonstration of problem solving for this project, considering how students would
 - Demonstrate that they understand the nature and context of the question that your project answers or the goal that your project seeks to achieve,
 - Design a strategy or strategies for the problem,
 - Use a process to evaluate strategies for solving the problem; and
 - Implement a strategy or strategies for solving the problem.

What aspects of this learning outcome form a simple foundation for problem solving, what aspects would you expect to build on that foundation, and what aspects would you expect from students who are able to create their own appropriate guidelines for successful problem solving?

2. As a result of participating in this experience, what would you like to observe in your students’ development of problem solving skills?

Cultural Competency

Learning Outcome: Cultural Competency				
Assignment:				
Developmental Level: [] Introduction [] Reinforcement [] Mastery				
Performance Level	Description – Effective Cultural Competency Subcomponents			
	Demonstrates cultural self-awareness	Displays positive attitudes (openness and curiosity) towards cultural differences	Articulates knowledge of different cultural practices and worldviews	Exhibits cross-cultural skills
Exemplary				
Proficient				
Competent				
Needs Improvement				
Inadequate				

1. Brainstorm the ideal demonstration of cultural competency for this project, considering how students would
 - Demonstrate awareness of their own culture and biases and articulate differences between their culture and that of others;
 - Display openness and curiosity when exposed to other cultural frameworks;
 - Articulate knowledge of the cultural practices and world views that are integral to other cultures; and
 - Exhibit cross-cultural skills including working with those with similar and different cultures, negotiating a shared understanding, incorporating diverse perspectives, expressing empathy, and appropriate use of verbal and non-verbal communication.

What aspects of this learning outcome form a simple foundation for cultural competency, what aspects would you expect to build on that foundation, and what aspects would you expect from students who are able to create their own appropriate guidelines for successful cultural competency?

2. As a result of participating in this experience, what would you like to observe in your students' development of cultural competency?

Social Responsibility

Learning Outcome: Social Responsibility			
Assignment:			
Developmental Level: [] Introduction [] Reinforcement [] Mastery			
Performance Level	Description – Social Responsibility Subcomponents		
	Displays intercultural competence	Practices civic responsibility	Engages in regional, national, and/or global communities
Exemplary			
Proficient			
Competent			
Needs Improvement			
Inadequate			

1. Brainstorm the ideal demonstration of social responsibility for this project, considering how students would
 - Display intercultural competence (the capability to shift one’s cultural perspective and appropriately adapt behavior to cultural differences and commonalities);
 - Practices civic responsibility through civic engagement, independent experiences, and/or civically-focused action; and
 - Engages in regional, national, and/or global communities to achieve civic goals

What aspects of this learning outcome form a simple foundation for social responsibility, what aspects would you expect to build on that foundation, and what aspects would you expect from students who are able to create their own appropriate guidelines for social responsibility?

2. As a result of participating in this experience, what would you like to observe in your students’ development of social responsibility?

Ethical Decision Making

Learning Outcome: Ethical Decision Making				
Assignment:				
Developmental Level: [] Introduction [] Reinforcement [] Mastery				
Performance Level				
	Description – Ethical Decision Making Subcomponents			
	Self-assesses ethical values	Assesses the social context of problems	Recognizes ethical issues in a variety of settings	Applies different ethical perspectives to ethical dilemmas and considers the ramifications of alternative actions
Exemplary				
Proficient				
Competent				
Needs Improvement				
Inadequate				

- Brainstorm the ideal demonstration of ethical decision making for this project, considering how students would
 - Self-assess their ethical values and core beliefs;
 - Assess the social context of problems through the use of major theories;
 - Recognize ethical issues in complex and diverse contexts; and
 - Accurately apply different ethical perspectives to ethical dilemmas and consider the ramifications of these perspectives and of alternative actions.

What aspects of this learning outcome form a simple foundation for cultural competency, what aspects would you expect to build on that foundation, and what aspects would you expect from students who are able to create their own appropriate guidelines for successful cultural competency?

- As a result of participating in this experience, what would you like to observe in your students’ development of ethical decision making?