Motivational profiles and learning experience across Chinese language proficiency levels

Xiaohong Wen a, *, Meiyu Piao b

a University of Houston, Department of Modern and Classical Languages, 613 Agnes Arnold Hall, 3553 Cullen Blvd., Houston, TX, 77204-3006, USA
b Beijing Youth Politics College, Office of International Students, No.9 Huajiadi Street, Chaoyang District, Beijing, 100102, China

ABSTRACT

This study examines how the Ideal self and the Ought-to self impact learning, and how future self-guides sustain L2 Chinese learning. Twenty college CFL students at three proficiency levels participated in two rounds of interviews to self-identify aspects of their motivation and motivational experience over a period of one semester. All interviews were recorded and transcribed for analysis. The results demonstrated that motivation factors that sustained Chinese language learning encompassed three dimensions: The ideal L2 self/intrinsic motivation, instrumentality, and future self-guides that triggered individual self-regulatory strategies. In addition, instrumentality and obligations transitioned from the ought-to self to the ideal L2 self in the learning process. The participants’ persistent desire to function in Chinese and retrospective assessments of their learning needs and styles guided them through their learning. When confronted with difficult situations, they monitored and readjusted based on their learning strengths and goals. Lastly, positive self-concept-related motivation interacted with learning experience, which reacted to adversities in context.

1. Background

In recent years there has been a shift towards a socio-dynamic perspective in language learning motivation research. The socio-dynamic perspective was developed to capture motivational complexities in a classroom setting. In this framework, L2 motivation is regarded as a situated construct. In the learning process, motivation may fluctuate over time and vary in relation to learning experience; for example, successful language learning itself leads to improved motivation (Ushioda, 1993). Studies have explored the relationship between individuals and context in terms of internal and social factors (e.g., Dörnyei et al., 2015; MacIntyre, Baker, & Sparling, 2017; Thompson & Vásquez, 2015; Waninge, Dörnyei, & De Bot, 2014). Dörnyei et al. (2015) argued that straightforward linear cause-effect relationships fail to offer a realistic account of motivational phenomena, suggesting that more dynamic contextual paradigms are required for the analysis of motivation. Such new paradigms include the ‘Person-in-Context Relational View of Motivation’ (Ushioda, 2009), and the synergy of identity, motivation, and autonomy in language learning (Murray, Gao, & Lamb, 2011). These paradigms enable researchers to analyze complex and multifaceted relationships between motivation, self, and context, highlighting the agency of L2 learners and taking into
account the fact that learners are located in particular social and cultural contexts. These factors, together with their L2 learning experience, directly shape their motivations and identities.

Learning a language is one part of one’s identity that reflects how one envisions oneself. Dörnyei’s (2005, 2009) L2 Motivational Self System framework views motivation and learner identity as emergent through interaction and ongoing situated processes. The key notion of the theory is the concept of the L2 Self, consisting of three motivational dimensions. First, the Ideal L2 Self encompasses aspirations that one desires to achieve. This motivation is powerful in reducing the discrepancy between actual and ideal selves, as it generates self-vision and imagery, and the future image guides present actions. Second, the Ought-to L2 Self refers to the attributes one believes one ought to possess to meet social expectations, and to avoid possible negative consequences. This is a prevention tactic related to safety, responsibilities, and obligations. Third, L2 Learning Experience refers to situated ‘executive’ motives related to the immediate learning environment and experience. In the learning process, a learner interacts with classroom-related factors such as the teacher, the curriculum, and the peer group, as well as the environment and native speakers (NSs). Learning experience significantly impacts learning and motivation.

The theoretical framework of the L2 Motivational Self System draws upon the Self-Discrepancy and ‘possible selves’ theories proposed by Higgins (1987) and Markus and Nurius (1986). They posited that imagery is critical in the process of visualization. A learner will be highly motivated if he/she is able to visualize a possible future self, and is able to take actions based on personal self-guides to reduce the discrepancy between his/her current self and imagined future self. From this perspective, motivation is viewed as inner desires from a learner to effect changes by ‘reducing the discrepancy between one’s actual self and the projected behavioural standards of the ideal/ought selves’ (Dörnyei, 2009, p. 18). In the process, relevant procedural strategies are important in the development of the ideal and ought-to selves (McEown, Sawaki, & Harada, 2017; Yashima, Nishida, & Mizumoto, 2017). When a learner’s future self image is accompanied by procedural strategies, ‘a repertoire of appropriate plans, scripts, and self regulatory strategies’ (Dörnyei, 2009, p25), the learner is usually successful in L2 learning. As such, motivation is seen as originating from L2 learners themselves, characterized as an internal drive to become a possible self with a strong future image and a roadmap of tasks and strategies.

The framework also expands L2 motivation to learning experience, which comprehensively connects learner, learning context, and motivation. Learning experience, with a focus on the effect of the context on the individual’s psychological perceptions of themselves, interacts with motivation in the process. All interactions, in and beyond the classroom and with instructors and peers, construct experience in positive or negative ways. Furthermore, it is not only the learning context that affects learners; learners can also affect the context. These concepts are central to our understanding of ‘why people do what they do’ from ‘a person-in-context relational view’ (Ushioda, 2009) and the learner autonomy perspective (Murray et al., 2011). Cszér and Lukács (2010) examined motivation, attitudes, and selves with secondary school students learning English and German in Hungary. Their results showed that the ideal self and the L2 learning experience represented two distinct dimensions. The ideal L2 self was a significant predictor of motivated behavior across both the English and German groups, whereas the L2 learning experience did not consistently predict motivated behavior across both groups.

A number of studies (e.g., Csizer & Kormos, 2009; Lamb, 2009; Papi, 2010; Ryan, 2009; Syed, 2001; Taguchi, Magid, & Papi, 2009; Ushioda, 2009; Xie, 2014; Yashima et al., 2017) have tested the validity of the L2 Motivational Self System across various contexts in different countries. Many explored individual learner characteristics, particularly motivation situated in a classroom setting. A study by Waninge et al. (2014) focused on the dynamic and changeable nature of the motivation process. It explored three key aspects of the dynamics of motivational development: change, stability, and contextual dependency. The results demonstrated that motivation is inseparable from the learner’s individual learning context, and motivation changes over time on an individual level, although there are stable phases. Along similar lines, and also situated in a classroom where the dynamic nature of motivation is evident, the present study investigated the interactions between motivation factors, learning experience, and the learners’ strategies to sustain learning. Unlike many previous studies, it examined motivation not only at multiple proficiency levels (cross-sectional), but also through a design spanning a period of one semester. Learning experience and motivation are significantly influenced by contexts, peers, instruction, and self-regulatory strategies (Ushioda & Dörnyei, 2012). These issues, although less researched, are the core of motivation research, and were explored in this study.

L2 motivation research has primarily focused on EFL/ESL learning (Thompson, 2017). Studies on other languages, particularly Chinese, are rare. The present study addresses this gap in the current literature. Chinese, once a less commonly taught language in the US, has burgeoned in the past two decades. There was a 195% increase in Chinese language enrollment from 2004 to 2008 in K-12 US public schools (ACTFL, 2011). More than a dozen large flagship Chinese programs, sponsored by the US government as a long-term strategic plan, train students up to near-native proficiency (NSEP, 2020). Along with globalization and diversity in today’s multilingual context, Chinese is becoming another international language and learners in a L2 Chinese classroom are often multilinguals (Wang, 2019). Although Chinese poses a high difficulty level for many, it is regarded as a tool in the international context for students to function as global professionals.

1.1. Chinese learning motivation

To our knowledge, there are few studies applying the L2 motivational self system to the L2 Chinese context. Xie (2014) examined the validity of the framework with heritage and nonheritage learners. The results showed that the L2 motivational self system can indeed be extended to motivation studies of L2 Chinese, for both heritage and nonheritage learners. In a different research agenda, Cai and Zhu (2012) investigated the impact of instructional intervention via a technology-
integrated project on university students’ motivation. Both motivating and demotivating features of the online project were identified from the participants’ responses. The study revealed that the online learning project promoted students’ motivation in L2 experience, but no significant differences were discovered in terms of the ideal self and the ought-to self. These findings seem to conflict with the results of Xie’s study, which demonstrated the validity of the framework including the ideal and ought-to selves. Cai and Zhu (2012) posited that such findings provide evidence for the ‘fairly robust’ nature of the ideal and ought-to selves, making them unlikely to be influenced by a short intervention, whereas learning experience changed significantly suggesting that ‘L2 learning experience is a more fluid and dynamic aspect of motivation and may change noticeably even within a relatively short period of time’ (Cai & Zhu, 2012, p. 323).

Campbell and Storch (2011) examined the factors that shape the choice of learning Chinese and ongoing motivation among college students in Australia. The results demonstrated that language choice was closely related to personal goals and beliefs about China’s future, which may bring potential job opportunities. When confronting demotivating contextual factors, participants were not always demotivated because they had developed a strong L2 self-identity which stabilized their motivational state. This study presented insights on L2 Chinese learners’ motivation fluctuation. However, it did not provide details on how students sustained their learning in the process, such as strategies adopted and interactions between learning experience and self-regulatory skills.

Most research in L2 Chinese motivation has adopted the survey-based method and quantitative analysis to investigate motivational constructs (Lu & Li, 2008; Rueda & Chen, 2005; Sung, 2013; Wen, 2013; Xie, 2014, Yu & Downing, 2012). Wen (2013) identified six motivation factors. Instrumentality is a significant predictor for the elementary group, together with positive learning experience and social milieu, accounting for 30% of the variance in intended future Chinese study. Instrumentality continues to be a robust and significant predictor for the intermediate group. For the advanced group, self-confidence is significant in predicting intended future Chinese study. The results suggest that those who desire a certain level of language proficiency would start and continue learning until reaching that level. There seems to be a relatively stable phase between the elementary and intermediate levels. The dynamics of students’ motivation, however, change at the advanced level, with linguistic self-confidence becoming more robust. Importantly, the results indicate that as proficiency level increases, learners’ motivation goes through changes from more extrinsic motivation, such as instrumentality, to more intrinsic motivation such as self-confidence (cf., Comanaru & Noels, 2009; Noels, Pelletier, Clément, & Vallerand, 2000).

Three features have emerged in summarizing L2 Chinese motivation research. First, most of the studies took traditional theoretical approaches that are often unable to address the complex nature of motivation. Second, those that adopted the current theoretical framework tested the model’s validity, examined the impact of technology on motivation, or explored language choice and motivation fluctuations. None scrutinized motivation and strategies that sustain learning L2 Chinese and how motivation factors and learning interact over time. Although Wen (2013) study revealed motivation changes, the changes were detected at the macro level. The study did not examine the emergent nature of motivation in the learning process, and nor did it account for changes in relation to individual learning experience. Third, the L2 learning experience component is under-researched. This may be because it is difficult for studies with large sample sizes and a quantitative approach to measure the specific and fluid learning experiences of individual students, as discussed by Cai and Zhu (2012). This may also be because learning experience is an added dimension focusing on the learning environment. Learning experience is different from the ideal and ought-to selves that are deeply rooted in well-established self theories from general psychology. As Dörnyei (2009, p. 29) commented, learning experience is ‘conceptualized at a different level from the two self-guides, and future research will hopefully elaborate on the self aspects of this bottom-up process.’

This study adopted the framework of the L2 motivational self-system and a qualitative perspective to address missing details in interactions among motivation, learning, and context. A qualitative perspective allows us to capture significant information about learners’ perceptions and motivations in a particular context, and allowing learners to self-identify important aspects of their motivation (Campbell & Storch, 2011; Ushioda, 2001). This study, based on Wen (2013) study, expands the scope on future self-guides and learning experience via an alternative research method. It constitutes an attempt to discover emerging motivation in the learning process across the spectrum of teaching, peer interaction, and learning contexts. The study focuses on how the Ideal and Ought-to L2 selves impact learning and how future self-guides influence motivated behavior. There were three research questions that guided the study:

1. What are the motivational factors influencing learners to choose to learn Chinese despite its high difficulty level as a non-alphabetic language?
2. What motivations particularly sustain the continued study of Chinese?
3. How do motivational factors and learning experience interact over time?

2. Methods

2.1. Setting and participants

The study was conducted at a US university located in a metropolitan city. There is a large and fast-developing Chinatown in the city. Courses offered at the university include a BA degree and a minor in Chinese Studies. All the courses are credit-bearing.
In the first week of a spring semester, we went to seven classes to present a brief description of the project and invite participants. Twenty-four students volunteered, but four later dropped out; a final total of twenty students (9 females, 11 males, with a median age of 22) participated in both interviews. Among them, 15 were multilingual with English, Spanish, and/or Asian languages while taking Chinese courses. There were 4 heritage and 16 non-heritage learners representing three proficiency levels: 7, 6, and 7 participants from the elementary, intermediate, and advanced levels respectively. The elementary group had learned Chinese for six months, the intermediate group for 18 months, and the advanced group for a minimum of 30 months. Chinese language courses met for 3 h per week. Sixteen of the participants were majoring or minoring in Chinese Studies. Several participants who majored in Chinese Studies also double majored in other disciplines. Participants were identified as heritage learners if one of their ancestors/relatives was Chinese and/or one parent’s native language was Chinese (Wen, 2011). All four heritage learners were born in the US.

2.2. Instruments

Semi-structured interviews were conducted twice, at the beginning and the end of the semester. Interview questions were developed based on the goals and the current study’s validity (Maxwell, 1996). Although the questions were pre-planned, we discussed new issues as they arose during the interview. The interviews were intended not only to capture the internal patterns of thinking underlying the participant’s motivation, but also the external factors that influenced their engagement in learning.

Based on the study’s goals and research questions, the interview questions included these aspects: the motivational factors that shaped the choice to learn the Chinese language, the motivation and learning strategies that particularly sustain learning, examples of successful or unsuccessful learning experiences, stories of overcoming difficulties in the learning process, and self-concept-related motivation. Similar questions were used in the two interviews, with different foci. The first interview was intended to develop a comprehensive understanding of the participant’s ideal self and ought-to self in choosing Chinese, and the motivators that sustained learning. The second interview focused on motivation development over time, the interaction between future self-guides and learning engagement, and between learning experience and self-concept-related motivation.

A pilot study was conducted to ensure the instrument’s clarity and relevancy. The pilot study resulted in a few wording revisions; for example, in the item, ‘Can you imagine yourself in the future successfully using Chinese?’ the word ‘successfully’ was replaced with ‘fluently’ because the definition of ‘successfully’ is vague, as stated by one of the participants.

2.3. Data collection

During the second week and the thirteenth/fourteenth weeks of the spring semester we conducted the first and second rounds of individual interviews respectively. The interviews lasted 45—55 min. All the interviews were conducted in person in a quiet office.

2.4. Data analysis

All the interviews were recorded and transcribed. The transcriptions were cross-checked by the authors. We took an inductive approach for the data coding and analysis. In this process, both authors identified themes that appeared prominent in the transcripts. These themes related to learners’ motivation in general and the L2 motivational self system in particular. We each analyzed the data using the thematic framework, discussed coding differences, and reached consensus at an inter-rater reliability of 95%. In addition, a member check was conducted by providing each participant with a summary of his/her motivation profile after the interview.

In the next section, excerpts quoted are from participants identified by pseudonyms, followed by their proficiency level (Elem. Interm. Adv.), a number, and their heritage status: Chinese heritage learner (CHL) or nonheritage learner (NHL).

3. Results

3.1. Motivation factors for learners to choose to study Chinese

3.1.1. The ideal L2 self: intrinsic motivation

Dörnyei (2009) commented that the L2 motivational self system corresponds with a number of existing motivation constructs including intrinsic motivation. The ideal self in this study is frequently realized in the form of intrinsic motivation. Intrinsic motivation refers to the motivation to engage in an activity which provides personal enjoyment, e.g., innate needs for competent performance. Scholars (Deci & Ryan, 1985; Noels, 2001, 2003; Noels et al., 2000) speculate that if individuals can choose a task, they will seek challenging situations for a sense of competence and satisfaction. Intrinsic motivation in this study consists of three components: 1) a profound interest in the Chinese language and culture, 2) positive experience with
native speakers (NS) or China during their study abroad programs, and 3) an intrinsic desire to be competent in the Chinese language.

3.1.2. Profound interest in the Chinese language and culture

Many participants started learning Chinese because of its perceived challenges. Furthermore, it was not only the challenge of learning a difficult language, but also a passion for Chinese culture that triggered their learning. Their passion for Chinese culture was closely integrated into their life and embodied by hobbies including martial arts, Chinese visual arts and current media. Brian (Adv. #20, NHL), Ellen (Elem. #4, NHL), and Jerry (Interm. #12, NHL) all started practicing martial arts at a young age. Learning Chinese was an internal calling, a way for them to fulfill their desires to learn more about Chinese culture. This projected their identity as part of their ideal L2 self. Brian took almost four years of Chinese language courses, although he was not a Chinese major. Jerry, a multilingual, was a Chinese major whose love for Chinese martial arts was his persistent inspiration:

Excerpt 1

I grew up in a Mexican family, we had a lot of domestic violence. There wasn’t a lot of respect for anybody … the culture, and how there’s a lot of respect in your [the interviewer who was a Chinese NS] family. And I wanted that from my family. … so you could say I fell in love with the Chinese culture first, not the language.

In summary, Dörnyei’s ideal L2 self, Gardner’s integrative motivation, and intrinsic need and desire characterize the participants’ attitudes toward their learning. Their passion for Chinese language and culture and their ideal selves were embodied in their desire to embrace the challenge of learning Chinese, their long-term cultural practices, and cultural values that were missing from their personal or family environments.

3.1.3. Enjoyable experience with Chinese speakers and/or in study-abroad programs

A profound interest in the Chinese language and culture does not emerge in a vacuum, but through a variety of socio-cultural encounters as learners have enjoyable experiences with Chinese friends and/or when living in China. The increasing number of study-abroad programs and exposure to Chinese NSs in Chinatown opened up opportunities to experience Chinese influences. All the participants who had been to China or who had Chinese friends described their experiences by using words such as ‘gratifying’, ‘memorable’, ‘fun’, and ‘enjoyed’, conveying their enthusiastic attitudes. Such positive socio-cultural encounters promoted a strong desire to improve their Chinese. For instance, Brittany (Interm. #11, NHL) had enjoyed her friendship with her Taiwanese friends ever since she was young, when her parents found a Taiwanese tutor for her. She enrolled in Chinese courses when she entered high school. Her teacher was Taiwanese, and the first friend she made in high school was also from Taiwan; Brittany fell in love with the Taiwanese culture. She went to Taiwan to visit her friends, and then again to learn Chinese for one year. Ellen (Elem. #4, NHL) shared a similar experience; she went to China with her martial arts school, which triggered a strong desire to communicate with Chinese people. She ‘loved the experience and wanted to go back again’. She did go back after she taught herself Chinese. Don (Elem. #2, NHL) provided another example:

Excerpt 3

I want to be able to communicate with Chinese people. The times when I had in the past, specifically when I spent some time actually staying in China before, I found it really gratifying. It was fun. I just enjoyed the whole experience. I liked the cultural exchange. I like to be able to kind of show up and understand the language and be able to express myself. So, yes, it’s out of the interest of it really.

The integrative desires experienced by participants impacted their self imagery about learning Chinese and making friends with Chinese NSs. Kelly (Elem. #6, NHL) briefly summarized her experience as follows: ‘Personally, I love Chinese people, I
have a deep passion for them, just wanna know them more, and be more involved.' These interests were developed through personal experiences with NSs, and enhanced by strong aspirations to be able to communicate with them.

3.1.4. Strong desire to be competent in L2 Chinese

One distinctive feature of participants’ ideal L2 selves was their determination to become linguistically competent in an additional language, in this case Chinese. Acquiring a foreign language enhances one’s self-identity. Participants expressed their desire for an additional language in general and Chinese in particular. For instance, John (Interm. #8, NHL) commented that learning languages constituted his future-self-identity; whereas learning Chinese was a decision derived from societal expectations:

Excerpt 4

I chose Chinese language because I never really enjoy learning things, the only thing I really do enjoy learning is languages … and I picked Chinese Studies because that’s how China has recently been evolving and going ahead. I also just, I know I really like how the Chinese language sounds to me.

Both Excerpts 4 and 1, together with other interview data, suggest that the participants conceived of themselves as multilingual. This self-identity guided their future projected visions of themselves. They chose Chinese, because of the availability of Chinese culture, e.g., martial arts, in addition to their intrinsic passion for the Chinese language. Their accounts of their Chinese learning motivation are consistent with Dörnyei (2009) reconceptualization of integrativeness, the ideal L2 self.

In addition, they wanted to acquire a high level of proficiency to function in Chinese. Molly (Interm. #9, NHL) expressed her desire as follows: ‘I want to be fluent in Chinese and use it for my everyday life.’ Tim (Elem. #3, NHL), who had just started learning Chinese, stated: ‘I wanna take a few more advanced courses, hopefully get to where I can carry on conversation, read a newspaper maybe.’ Ellen commented: ‘I want to speak well enough that a native speaker can understand what I say.’ In addition, participants’ integrative motivation to acquire knowledge of Chinese culture via the language was evidenced throughout the data. For example, Excerpt 5 from Don (Elem. #2, NHL) demonstrates that learning the language and enlarging cultural understanding are closely connected and enhance each other:

Excerpt 5

I want to be able to speak articulately, so I don’t have to translate in my head, I want to be able to speak as comfortably as I can in English. Hopefully, in the process I can learn new things like Chinese culture and Chinese philosophy, different parts of Chinese history.

In summary, the participants’ future projected vision was very much influenced by their desires for integrativeness as well as their intrinsic desires for Chinese language competency. Their ideal L2 selves were substantiated by this future self-identity.

3.2. The instrumental goal of working in international companies

Instrumental motivation concerns the perceived usefulness of learning an L2. A certain level of L2 proficiency may bring future job opportunities. Participants clearly linked Chinese proficiency to their career trajectory. Although such an aspiration was voiced by all, there were discrepancies between the groups at the lower and more advanced levels. In addition, the data showed a transition from the ought-to L2 self, e.g., learning Chinese for foreign language requirements or a China-related job, to the ideal L2 self, e.g., for the purpose of enhancing one’s career via a high level of Chinese proficiency. The former (the ought-to self) is on the more instrumental end of the spectrum, whereas the latter (the ideal self) is driven by the projected vision of oneself as a future successful professional. For instance, Mindy (Elem. #1, CHL) believed that learning Chinese would ‘open up my channel or my opportunity more to all over the world. … and [give] me an upper hand to get a job overseas too’. Her choice was greatly influenced by external factors such as the role China plays internationally. Such a motivation seems to be utilitarian oriented, and may fade away once the required proficiency level is reached (Wen, 2013).

In contrast, participants at the advanced level focused less on the utilitarian role of the language, and more on concrete career images and personal plans identified with their future work advancement. Their desire to be competent in their work via the Chinese language reflected the less instrumental end of the spectrum. For instance, both Brian (Adv. #20, NHL) and Derek (Adv. #16, NHL) majored in physics and both wanted to use the Chinese language in their jobs, ‘kind of work with Chinese physicists in China, possibly in the physics field,’ said Brian. Derek hoped that he might receive either a US or a Chinese government scholarship to go to China for his graduate work. Learning Chinese for them was part of their future projected vision of their ideal L2 self, with deeply felt personal needs for their career plans.

Furthermore, there was a coexistence of an intrinsic desire to communicate with Chinese NSs and for family/social obligations (Excerpt 6, Sheldon, Elem. #5, NHL), and to be competent in languages as a multilingual (Excerpt 7, Alice, Elem. #7, NHL) for the sake of international business, giving a fuller picture of learners’ ideal and ought-to selves:
Excerpt 6

I really like to communicate with people, because that is my passion, to be able to talk to anyone. And since 25% of the world population is speaking Chinese, I think it is profitable for me learning Chinese. ... And my father is also a business man, so we do business with Chinese.

Excerpt 7

Because I wanted to do international business, I already knew Spanish, so I didn’t want to study Spanish. And I like learning languages. It was a new opportunity, so I chose to study the Chinese language.

It is important to note that learners’ motivations encompass multiple perspectives across the ideal self and ought-to L2 self dimensions. Many were inspired by the Chinese culture, friendship with Chinese NSs, and perceived opportunities that Chinese proficiency may offer for their future careers, among other factors. Among 20 participants, 3 had martial arts training at a young age, 15 frequently used Chinese media and enjoyed Chinese popular culture via the media, and 6 considered the Chinese culture to be missing in their lives and felt compelled to include it. All expressed their strong desire to be competent in Chinese, as George (Intern. #10, NHL) stated: ‘I would like to get to the highest level, as proficient as I can, I would really like to be fluent and be able to hold a conversation back and forth as best I can.’ The ought-to L2 self included a wide spectrum of aspects, ranging from merely utilitarian purposes or societal/family expectations to a learner’s self-identity in being able to use the Chinese language to fulfill their goals for their future work as professionals, or their self-desire to be heritage family members.

3.3. Sustained motivation and motivation fluctuation

One distinctive feature of the L2 Motivational Self System is the motivational guiding function to sustain learning. Two major types of motivation that sustain learning emerged from the data. The first was future self-guides, which triggered the execution of self-regulatory mechanisms such as informative assessments and feedback from contextualized interactions. The data showed that learners, empowered with motivational strategies and positive experiences, were able to engage in learning to overcome situational adversities. The second was the interaction between learning experience and self-concept-related motivation, which generated new goals and future self-guides. Interactions with instructors, peers, NSs, class activities, and contexts are all subsumed within the learning experience. Effective instruction tailored to learners’ needs helps to develop positive and enjoyable learning experiences, which in turn contribute to a higher level of self-confidence.

3.3.1. Future self-guides: strategies for continuing Chinese studies

Future self-guides are derived from future self images. If learners can vividly envision their L2 future selves, they are likely to develop future self-guides that promote committed effort in their daily tasks. The two rounds of interviews revealed participants’ motivation development over a period of one semester. Similarities between the two rounds of interview data included the participants’ enthusiasm for class activities and course-related work. They were motivated to actively participate in class as ‘much as I can’ (Tim, Sheldon, Molly, George, Claire, Derek, Brian), and to ‘raise hands’ and ‘volunteer’ to try out ‘the newly learned vocabulary and sentence structures’ in class. They tried to ‘interact more with classmates’ who may be NSs, and enjoyed peer learning and helping each other: ‘Work with each other, ask each other questions.’ Particularly, participants at the advanced level commented that sustained motivation promoted a higher level of cognitive skill and autonomous learning, as Derek (Adv. #16, NHL) and Brian (Adv. #20, NHL) noted respectively:

Excerpt 9

I do actively participate. I try to think of examples that challenge my knowledge of Chinese language or try to use the new grammar in a creative way. Because in doing that, I often learn what I can and can’t do with the grammar pattern in Chinese, because often in English, I can, it makes perfect sense. But it doesn’t translate the same way. So I do try to give as many examples when we go over new vocabulary or grammar, to try to use it in ways that I think are less obvious.

Excerpt 10

To reach the plan, really just, remind myself all the time to think about new ways to say things, don’t say the same things over and over again. So I think that is the way to reach the plan, conscious effort. I need also speak more Chinese outside of the school. I think to achieve the goals, that’s another one of my goals, speak more Chinese.

The largest differences between the first and second rounds of interviews included the increasing number of self-regulated strategies as participants developed autonomy in learning. They were able to reflect on their learning to discover effective
methods for their learning styles. For instance, Jerry (Interm. #12, NHL) commented on his learning style: ‘I’m a more auditory learner, so I record the classes. When I’m not in class, I listen to the classes, so as to keep it going better, keep it in my head better.’ Jerry’s self-directed learning was shared by others. Ellen (Elem. #4, NHL) recognized that her learning style was distinctively visual. She fostered this by practicing writing repeatedly but with a different goal each time, as she commented: ‘but now, the final time I copy, I look at the English, and I try to remember the translation and translate the dialogue. That seems to help, too, make you think rather than just copying the words.’

Participants also expanded the number of media types they used, and were able to accommodate their learning needs by choosing appropriate media and materials. They used podcasts, movies, dramas, YouTube videos, and TV programs to enhance their listening comprehension and cultural understanding, and used texting to improve their production. Utilization of these media was not part of the instructional assignments, but originated by participants in their active learning.

Tables 1 and 2 summarize the first and second rounds respectively of the interviews on self-regulatory strategies derived from future self-guides. We have tried to preserve the original participants’ quotes as much as possible.

It is worth noting that participants, particularly at the higher level, constantly and informatively assessed their learning. Many monitored their learning via self-regulatory strategies such as ‘talk[ing] to new friends in Chinese; back and forth all the time to know how to use those we learned in the class.’ Another example that emerged from the data was ‘reviewing,’ a routine strategy used by all advanced participants, as commented by Doug (Adv. #19, CHL):

Excerpt 12

I feel like if you can come up with your own sentences using that grammar pattern, then that means you’ve grasped it; but if you can’t, that means you must review it and go over it again. So I think that’s a very useful way.

Similarly, Derek (Adv. #16, NHL) stated that he often looked back at previous chapters to review the material because ‘I know it’s easy to quickly lose, especially writing the words, producing the written language.’ The consequences of reviewing brought satisfaction and confidence to participants, as Claire (Adv. #14, CHL) stated: ‘So now I go to the class and I know what we are learning because I reviewed it before we go to class.’

Tables 1 and 2 both show that participants not only aimed high but also adopted a wide range of strategies to achieve their desired goals. Subsequently these strategies and effort sustained their learning, which in turn enhanced their motivation.

3.3.2. Interaction: self-concept-related motivation factors and learning experience

Dörnyei (2009, p. 29) postulated that learning experience ‘concerns situated, ‘executive’ motives related to the immediate learning environment and experience.’ Self-concept-related motivation, e.g., self-satisfaction and self-confidence, is frequently derived from learning experience and assessments from learners themselves (Tunçel, 2015; Wen, 2013). Learning experiences can positively or negatively affect learning, which in turn strengthens or weakens the ideal and ought-to L2 selves. Overwhelming amounts of Chinese coursework and a challenging environment can be intimidating. However, when a learner’s self-concept is compatible with personal guides, he/she is able to reduce the discrepancy between his/her actual self and the projected behavioral standards of the ideal/ought-to selves (Dörnyei, 2009, p. 18). Our data showed that participants were able to develop future self-guides that triggered the execution of self-regulatory mechanisms to sustain their motivation. One such an example was from George (Interm. #10, NHL), who originally took Chinese courses because of foreign language requirements. He was a transfer student from a community college. He encountered numerous obstacles in his new learning context, as he described in his first interview:

Table 1
Committed effort and self-regulatory strategies. First round interviews.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Strategy types</th>
<th>Strategies in Speaking Chinese</th>
<th>Active participation in class activities</th>
<th>Commitment to course-related work</th>
<th>Active learning, media, risk-taking</th>
<th>Self-regulatory strategies, e.g., self-assessments, learning styles/needs</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Examples</td>
<td>1 Converse w/ lang. partners</td>
<td>Repeatedly practice class-related work</td>
<td>1 Use tech and media, Instagram; cards, TV, videos, texting</td>
<td>1 Learn how to write characters because I forget easily</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2 Study and speak w/ NSs and friends</td>
<td>Keep up – take week by week</td>
<td>Manage time</td>
<td>2 Focused, write notes; record the class – I’m an auditory learner</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>3 Find a community to practice</td>
<td>Study and study, keep up with my Chinese classes</td>
<td>Try to go along with the class and speak even if I’m wrong and scared</td>
<td>3 Review for better retention in class, practice with equivalent or higher peers</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>4 Practice w/ peers</td>
<td>1 Use tech and media, Instagram; cards, TV, videos, texting</td>
<td>Risk-taking</td>
<td>4 Expand vocabulary, learn slang</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>5 Repetition</td>
<td>Messing up and continuously practicing/terrified but like it</td>
<td>5 Messing up and continuously practicing/terrified but like it</td>
<td>5 Work on grammar</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>6 Like spontaneous speaking</td>
<td>Commitment to course-related work</td>
<td>1 Repeatedly practice class-related work</td>
<td>6 Consious effort, remind myself to think about new way to say things</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td># Elem.</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>7 Self-assessment</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td># Interm</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>8 Learning plans</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td># Adv.</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>7</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>13</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Freq.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Taiwanese shows and music videos. In his second interview, he commented on how he eventually gained more self-confidence in the process. He continued learning, as he commented in his second interview: ‘I am doing Chinese as a foreign language credit, but I find it very interesting. It’s more than just giving me credit … I want to learn it, I want to progress. I want to get better.’

George’s learning experience illustrates that learning environment and context contribute substantially to shaping L2 motivation and self-confidence. George’s motivation was actually strengthened as he encountered adversities from external pressures. Data from other participants, especially those at more advanced levels, revealed that their retrospective understanding of themselves guided them in handling obstacles. Intrinsic motivation and self-confidence played a significant role, as Todd (Adv.#15, NHL) described, reflecting on his taking risks and making mistakes:

```
Excerpt 13

I found things were so different here, a brand new teacher, brand new classes. It was all brand new, and even the text book was different. I started kind of bottom of the class.

However, George did not quit; his ought-to self kept him on track to meet the two-year foreign language requirement. In the process, his motivation underwent changes. He ‘liked to learn Chinese, wanted to do a good job and learn Chinese well.’ Consequently, he was not demotivated, but was able to focus on learning, particularly focusing on his weakness in writing Chinese characters. He persisted throughout the semester and found learning to write Chinese characters in strokes was meaningful and enjoyable.

Excerpt 14

… comparing myself to my classmates, I found myself better and better, more comfortable. That was why I’m very satisfied. I set it [his learning goal] up, kind of rocky. I eventually worked my way up in the class. I’m still not the best of my class, but I’m much better than I was.

George’s ought-to L2 self required him to start Chinese, but he achieved ‘a harmony’ between his ought-to and ideal selves in the process. He continued learning, as he commented in his second interview: ‘I’m doing Chinese as a foreign language credit, but I find it very interesting. It’s more than just giving me credit … I want to learn it, I want to progress. I want to get better.’

```

Table 2
Committed effort and self-regulatory strategies. Second round interviews.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Examples</th>
<th>Active participation in class activities</th>
<th>Commitment to course-related work</th>
<th>Active learning, media, risk-taking</th>
<th>Self-regulatory strategies, e.g., self-assessments, learning styles/needs</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>1 At least try once voluntarily in the class</td>
<td>1 Attend the class and work hard</td>
<td>1 I’m visual, copy dialogues, listen to vocabulary</td>
<td>13 Should practice more speaking</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2 Participate and get feedback on the spot</td>
<td>2 Be diligent about studying and practice more</td>
<td>2 Daily conversation with family, practice grammar to make my Chinese more sophisticated</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>3 I like activities such as debates</td>
<td>3 Followed all of the class materials including all of the grammar patterns and vocab in the book</td>
<td>3 Audio learner, listen to the whole thing instead of thinking about each individual part</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>4 In classes, practicing how to use the grammar patterns with classmates</td>
<td>4 Do all the homework</td>
<td>4 I am visual: copy dialogues in Pinyin; then Hanzi translation</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>5 I do actively participate, try to think of examples that challenge my Chinese knowledge or try to use the new grammar in a creative way</td>
<td>5 I write a lot of stuff down and take better notes; Try and try</td>
<td>5 Copy and write characters, Pinyin, speak in mind when writing; try to apply Chinese whenever I can</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>6 Interact more with NS students in class</td>
<td>6 Try and try</td>
<td>6 Talk to new friends in Chinese: back and forth all the time — to know how to use those we learned in class</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>7 I want to be the first to stand up to present the group work</td>
<td>7 Attend the class and work hard</td>
<td>7 Texting in Chinese</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>8 Work with each other, ask each other questions</td>
<td>8 Be diligent about studying and practice more</td>
<td>8 Apply the grammar patterns learned in class in multiple ways; flash cards don’t work for me. I have to write characters again and again</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>9 I like to make sure that we actually understand the grammar pattern being taught with my classmates</td>
<td>9 I like activities such as debates</td>
<td>9 Go back to previous chapters and review the material, because I know it’s easy to quickly lose it</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>10 Practitioners in Chinese</td>
<td>10 Review what is learned daily</td>
<td>10 Trying to think of different ways to say things. I try to listen to native speakers to see how they speak</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>11 Practice more, more diverse in vocabulary</td>
<td>11 Practice more, more diverse in vocabulary</td>
<td>11 Practice more, more diverse in vocabulary</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>12 Review what is learned daily</td>
<td>12 Review what is learned daily</td>
<td>12 Review what is learned daily</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>13 Should practice more speaking</td>
<td>13 Should practice more speaking</td>
<td>13 Should practice more speaking</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Excerpt 15

*I really like [class] activities where you get forced to speak free sentences, I really love it. Because, yes, I'm terrified. ... I practice with my friends or the people that I meet in Chinatown, it does have a level of informality to it. So I really enjoy those even though I am terrified. ... I'm confident because I have accepted that I would mess it up.*

Todd, like many participants, was not demotivated, but developed a positive attitude and learning strategies in which he is ‘going to make mistakes and be corrected’. Motivation fluctuates in the learning process. Sustaining factors, such as self-satisfaction derived from learning effort and self-confidence developed through learning assessment, enable learners to generate new goals and stronger future self-guides to react to environmental challenges. Learners were able to sustain learning at the advanced level with their gradually developing linguistic self-confidence. Table 3 presents the frequency of self-concept-related motivations and motivational sources, i.e., positive learning experiences. A Pearson correlation analysis revealed a significant relationship between positive learning experience and self-concept-related motivations. The correlation between positive learning experience and self-satisfaction was 0.97 and that between positive learning experience and self-confidence was 0.95, both significant at p < 0.05 (2-tailed). These findings lend support to the results of Wen’s study (2013), where the factor that predicts learners’ continuation of Chinese studies was linguistic self-confidence at the advanced level.

It should be noted that although the numbers in Table 3 appear to be similar across the three proficiency levels, they vary in magnitude. The words ‘pretty confident’ and ‘not shy’ appeared in the data from elementary participants. In contrast, words that show a high level of satisfaction and confidence appeared from more advanced participants. Examples include: ‘I learned a lot of higher level vocabulary, I felt more confident,’ and ‘feel more confident about answering questions overall’ as Doug (Adv. #19, CHL) exemplified:

Excerpt 16

*I think this semester I’m a lot more confident because through practicing the grammar patterns, I’m able to get them right. I feel just more confident that what I'm saying is grammatically and semantically correct.*

The positive interaction between self-concept-related motivation and learning experience not only provokes the execution of self-regulatory strategies, but also further generates self-confidence. Positive learning experience and self-assessment fundamentally enhance learners’ self-concept-related motivation. Excerpt 17 is from Brian (Adv. #20, NHL), revealing the relationship between his motivation, self-confidence, and language use:

Excerpt 17

*Whenever I felt like I could really speak the language, then my motivation is higher, because I wanted to learn more, I wanted to speak more, so my confidence affected my motivation a lot.*

4. Discussion

This study has explored all three key aspects of the L2 motivational self system. The qualitative data from two rounds of interviews, one semester apart, yielded a wealth of information about various components that participants perceived as being important to their Chinese language learning. Learners’ motivational concepts are deeply rooted in their socio-cultural background and derived from their learning experience. Learners who chose to enroll in Chinese language courses were motivated by two broad dimensions: 1) Intrinsic motivation, consisting of the desire for learning challenges, profound interest in the Chinese language and culture, enjoyable experiences with Chinese speakers and/or from study-abroad programs, and a strong passion for Chinese competence; and 2) The ought-to self, consisting of instrumentality for international jobs as well as ethnic/social expectations and obligations. The ideal L2 self is the anchor for participants to learn Chinese regardless of their ethnic backgrounds. They recognized that learning Chinese is challenging. However, it is the challenge itself that attracted them. They found Chinese culture and language to be personally appealing. The desire for integration was evident among all the participants, who were passionate about Chinese culture, visited the local Chinese community frequently, and made friends with Chinese NSs.

The ought-to L2 self was another major motivation that subsumes two motives in this study: instrumentality, and ethnic obligations perceived by CHLs. All participants, regardless of their proficiency levels and backgrounds, stated that their career

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Proficiency levels</th>
<th>Self-satisfaction</th>
<th>Self-confidence</th>
<th>Positive learning experience</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Elem.</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>25</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Inter.</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Adv.</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>19</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total Freq.</td>
<td>26</td>
<td>33</td>
<td>56</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 3

Frequency of self-concept-related motivation and learning experience.
may benefit from Chinese language competence. In other words, this concept reveals that learners perceive Chinese as an international language. Detailed examination revealed discrepancies between the lower versus the more advanced proficiency groups. The former’s perception was more utilitarian-oriented, whereas that of the latter was more concrete, with personal plans to become future professionals. When participants envisioned themselves to be members of a multilingual workforce community, ‘instrumentality’ gradually lost its original ‘utilitarian’ feature and changed to an intrinsic motive to sustain learning beyond the lower proficiency level. Therefore, instrumentality may undergo a transformation from the ought-to to the ideal L2 self. These results are consistent with Wen (2013) quantitative study, indicating that instrumentality is a significant factor for lower level learners who desire a certain level of language proficiency for perceived usefulness.

There is a wide range of motivational sources that sustain learning. Self-identity and vision in terms of L2 Chinese competence is a fundamental motivator, serving as a sustainable source to promote continuous learning. Participants envisioned conversations with their Chinese friends, traveling to Chinese-speaking countries, and engaging in future international jobs (cf., Noels et al., 2000). Very importantly, the ‘possible self’ triggered mechanisms of self-regulatory strategies and learner autonomy. In the learning process, participants gradually developed plausible and concrete future self-guides to resolve problems based on their constant self-assessment of their learning needs and styles. They were able to react positively to learning adversity and unexpected challenges from the context. In addition, their appropriate expectations of learning Chinese and their perceived task values supported their committed efforts to achieve their goals (cf., Loh, 2019; Wen, 1997). As Tables 2 and 3 demonstrate, participants adopted a wide spectrum of strategies, particularly the participants at higher proficiency levels and in the second round of interviews. Sustained motivation, derived from a learner’s personal interest in improving specific language skills and/or particular learning domains, promotes reengagement with their objectives in the learning process. These findings also lend support to Fryer’s (2019) account of individual differences in learning interests as a sustainable source of language motivation.

Interactions between motivation factors and learning experience can influence learners’ motivation and impact learning. Positive interactions strengthen motivation and inspire participants to react to environmental challenges. Supported by their future self-guides, participants were able to maintain their ideal L2 selves when they were faced with adversity. They evaluated their learning by reflecting on their own learning strengths and styles (e.g., audio versus visual, language or cultural backgrounds), as well as by understanding their own learning needs and strategies (e.g., vocabulary building, formal and informal language styles, tones, reading, writing, tests). Constantly readjusting their learning strategies and future self-guides based on their self-evaluation and feedback, participants were able to have positive learning experiences, derive a sense of satisfaction from their efforts, and build their confidence. A high degree of self-confidence and learner autonomy provide pleasure in continued learning engagement.

In addition, the data revealed a motivation transition from the ought-to self to the ideal L2 self. Several participants started Chinese courses because of the perceived utility of the Chinese language, foreign language requirements, or family/friends’ expectations. In the learning process, they changed their perspectives and developed a ‘desired L2 self.’ Their motivation underwent reshaping from extrinsic motivation to an intrinsic desire to achieve a higher level of competence, as seen the cases of Tim, George, Claire, Fred, and other participants. Participants’ comments on their motivating and demotivating experiences provide further insights that motivation fluctuates to a positive level when learners are able to handle difficulties including course load, peer pressure, instructional unfitness, and Chinese character challenges. They are able to generate stronger self-concept-related motivation and new goals drawing from their positive learning experience.

This study captures detailed interactions between motivation, learning context, and learning experience. First, the ideal self features intrinsic motivation, integrating future self images of Chinese language competence, the desire to learn a challenging language, and a derived sense of self-satisfaction from learning. Learners’ intrinsic motives and goals, plus self vision, account for their choice of the Chinese language. Second, the ought-to self displays changeable characteristics from extrinsic to intrinsic motivation, contingent on learners’ construction of positive experiences during the learning process. The transition from the ought-to to the ideal self was observed in a number of participants over the study period of a semester. Third, strategies adopted by the participants are highlighted by learner autonomy. Inspired by personal future self-guides, learners adopted a repertoire of strategies, including: 1) awareness of one’s learning styles and needs, 2) self-assessment of one linguistic strengths and weaknesses, 3) monitoring one’s learning goals and progress, 4) self-tailored learning materials and strategies outside of class, and 5) continuous readjustments in the learning process. Participants, especially those at the advanced level, were able to use relevant procedural strategies in appropriate situations to engage and sustain learning. Fourth, learning environment in terms of peers, instruction, and learning tasks affect learners’ self-concept-related motivators. The interaction is bidirectional, as learners and their motivation react and reshape the environment. These findings, together with those of other L2 motivation studies particularly from the qualitative perspective (e.g., Campbell & Storch, 2011; Lamb, 2009; Macintyre et al., 2017; Thompson & Vásquez, 2015; Ushioda, 2001), contribute detailed nuances to our understanding of L2 motivation in general, and Chinese motivation in particular.

4.1. Limitations and further inquiry

The present study is one of the first to apply the L2 motivational self-system in the L2 Chinese context. This longitudinal study examined Chinese language learning motivation at three proficiency levels. This multi-perspective analysis enriches the existing research literature in L2 motivation.
Nevertheless, the results should be regarded as tentative due to a number of limitations. First, the participants in this study may represent a group that was comparatively highly motivated. They volunteered their participation: 80% of them were majoring or minoring in Chinese Studies, and 75% were multilingual with Chinese as one of the languages. Multilingualism presents powerful identity experiences, with a learner’s languages interconnecting and interpenetrating each other (Henry, 2017). Second, although the qualitative approach we adopted enabled us to examine, in detail, a multitude of the motivation factors that contributed to fluctuation and interaction, a quantitative approach should also be adopted. For example, quantitative data on the time that participants spend and the frequency of their L2 Chinese learning, and how often they communicate in Chinese with their classmates or Chinese friends, could be an important criterion measure. Such data would validate our study in the area of motivated behavior.

In recent years, many L2 Chinese learners have been learning Chinese as an additional language. Individual differences among learners, both bilinguals and multilinguals, need to be examined. These issues require further scrutiny within and beyond learners and the learning context. In order to address these issues, the theoretical and empirical fields of L2 acquisition and motivation studies need to be expanded by adopting a cross-theoretical approach incorporating L2 motivation, general psychology, and language education. As Oga-Baldwin, Fryer, and Larson-Hall (2019) proposed when calling for individual differences research, wider theories can help to explain different aspects of learning and offer new directions. Opening up the field to a spectrum of paradigms will help us to achieve a more accurate and deeper understanding of L2 motivation.

CRediT authorship contribution statement

Xiaohong Wen: Conceptualization, Data curation, Formal analysis, Funding acquisition, Investigation, Methodology, Project administration, Resources, Validation, Writing - original draft, Writing - review & editing. Meiyu Piao: Data curation, Investigation, Writing - review.

Acknowledgements

We would like to thank the students and instructors who participated in this study. This study is supported by a Research Project Grant awarded to the first author by the University of Houston.

References


system.2019.102120.


], Attitudes, orientations, and motivations in language learning (pp. 97–136). Oxford: Blackwell.


